

**A. J. Aitken**

## **The extinction of Scotland in popular dictionaries of English (1987)<sup>1</sup>**

Edited by Caroline Macafee, 2015

How to cite this paper (adapt to the desired style): Aitken, A. J. (1987, 2015) 'The extinction of Scotland in popular dictionaries of English' in †A. J. Aitken, ed. Caroline Macafee, 'Collected Writings on the Scots Language' (2015), [online] Scots Language Centre [http://medio.scotslanguage.com/library/document/aitken/The\\_extinction\\_of\\_Scotland\\_in\\_popular\\_dictionaries\\_of\\_English\\_\(1987\)](http://medio.scotslanguage.com/library/document/aitken/The_extinction_of_Scotland_in_popular_dictionaries_of_English_(1987)) (accessed DATE). Originally published in Richard W. Bailey ed., *Dictionaries of English. Prospects for the Record of Our Language* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1987), 99–120.

[<sup>99</sup>] Many Scotsmen today, including myself, believe that our society, culture, history, and language, as well as our political and economic interests, are neglected or suppressed or submerged in those of what is called, especially by Conservative party politicians, “the nation as a whole” – the South of England-dominated, London-centred United Kingdom. We still continue, for example, to be chagrined by those of our overseas correspondents who address letters to us to “Edinburgh, England”, or, as often, “Edinburgh, Scotland, England”, and by the almost universal habit of overseas people and many English of confusing the names and concepts of Britain and England, so that our monarch becomes the Queen of England, our other leader the Prime Minister of England, the Union flag the flag of England, and when, as often happens when we are addressed by English politicians and even by some Scots, we are expected to accept the history of England as our history. Not long ago one of our members of the European Parliament exhorted a Fifeshire audience to recall their stirring past and recapture the spirit of their ancestors who defeated the Spanish Armada in 1588.

This submergence or extinction of Scotland, as Geoffrey Barrow (1981) called it, can also extend to its use of its own variety of the English language. One still encounters now and again from authorities hailing from South-East England the expression *British English* and *Standard British English* in referring to spoken varieties, when what is meant is English as spoken by the English middle and upper classes and, as an import, by the upper classes in Scotland. Recent examples of this tendency are Hugh Howse in the April 1985 issue of *English Today* and several occasions in the preface to the *Longman Dictionary of the English Language*. Longman’s preface even talks of “the neutral British English accent we show in this dictionary”, meaning English Received Pronunciation – neutral to whom, pray? There is, virtually, a written Standard British English. But there is no such thing in [<sup>100</sup>] speech – unless one extinguishes Scottish English, Irish English, Welsh English, and North-of-England English, for a start.

---

<sup>1</sup> Editor’s note: paper presented at the Colloquium on English Lexicography, 1985, Ann Arbor, Michigan. Originally published in Richard W. Bailey ed., *Dictionaries of English. Prospects for the Record of Our Language* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1987), 99–120. Reproduced by permission of the University of Michigan.

The text has been edited for uniformity of style with other Aitken papers and some bibliographical references have been expanded or added. The original page and note numbers are shown in square brackets. The change of bibliographic style means that some of the original notes have been dropped. Since digital publication does not suffer the same constraints of space as hard copy, I have laid out the lists of examples more expansively.

This paper will look at how far (if at all) and in what specific ways Scottish English is extinguished in the word lists of four substantial general dictionaries of English. I have assumed (without, I have to admit, testing this out) that these dictionaries are all likely to be more complete and accurate in their treatment of Scottish English than are their smaller companions – the ‘Everyday’, ‘Pocket’, and so on dictionaries of the same publishing houses – and than dictionaries specifically directed to the English-as-a-foreign-language market, such as the *Oxford Advanced Learner’s* and the *Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English*.

In preparing this chapter I did not have time to conduct a check of similar dictionaries published in the United States and elsewhere, but I did examine *Webster’s Third New International Dictionary* (WNID3), assuming that this would fairly represent the United States since it is likely to be at the very least as complete as any other U.S. dictionary of English. From a subsequent rapid scan of two other U.S. dictionaries (in the editions I had to hand – *Webster’s New Collegiate*, 1973, and *Webster’s New World*, 1980), it appeared that these were indeed far less generous to Scottish words and matters than either WNID3 or any of the U.K. dictionaries.

The dictionaries more fully treated in this paper and the abbreviations used to refer to them are these:

CDEL *Collins Dictionary of the English Language* (1979). “Extensive coverage of contemporary international English.”

COD *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Current English*. Seventh Edition (1982). “The most reliable authority on the spoken and written English of today.”

CTCD *Chambers Twentieth Century Dictionary*. New Edition (1983). “The most comprehensive single-volume dictionary of the English language.”

LDEL *Longman Dictionary of the English Language* (1984). “The most comprehensive and up-to-date authority on contemporary English throughout the world.”

WNID3 *Webster’s Third New International Dictionary* (1961).

In view of their places of publication and the claims that they make for themselves, the British dictionaries I have chosen ought, one <sup>[101]</sup> would suppose, to do justice to the vocabulary of Scottish English as well as of English English and other varieties of English. Let us see if they do.

What I did was to assemble an admittedly arbitrary selection of items of Scottish usage that I thought a major general dictionary of English might want to include. Now that the *Concise Scots Dictionary* (CSD)<sup>2</sup> is available, it would be possible to compile a more nearly random collection of test items from that dictionary, but this procedure would have taken longer to administer satisfactorily – it would have yielded a much higher incidence of nil returns than my list did, so more items would have to be tested; in any case the complete *Concise Scots Dictionary* was not readily available to me till shortly before the colloquium at which this paper was given. Meantime, readers may, if they so wish, regard my experiment as a pilot one and treat my conclusions as tentative, pending the more extended and more statistically rigorous investigation which it no doubt to be desired.

Except for that section of my list containing what I have called Burnsisms, I tried to confine myself to items that I believed to be fairly current among speakers of what is sometimes called Scottish Standard English, the usual spoken English of most native-educated Scots of the middle classes. But I deliberately tried to avoid usages that I believed to

---

<sup>2</sup> Editor’s note: a revised edition is in preparation by Scottish Language Dictionaries (as of 2015).

be mostly *confined* to speakers of what is often called broad Scots or Scots dialect, or to the literary variety of vernacular Scots that resembles it. Most items in sections 1, 2, 4, 5, and 10 belong primarily to spoken discourse. Items in sections 6 to 9 of course occur in both the spoken and the written modes; in writing they mostly occur in Standard English rather than in vernacular Scots settings. One or two items in section 3 were a little frivolously chosen – it is perhaps expecting a little much of a general English dictionary to include *Brocher* or *Teerie* – but otherwise all items are I believe generally current in the varieties of discourse I have specified. Some, but not all, of the items selected are not wholly specific to Scotland but occur also in other regional or national varieties, such as those of Northern England, New Zealand, or the United States – I have not tried to exclude these.

I thought it might be worthwhile grouping my total selection into several different functional types, most of which I have proposed in some of my earlier writings on Scottish English.<sup>3</sup> Here and there the allocations of items between types 1, 4, and 11 are questionable, and different speakers would probably differ about them, but it still seemed worthwhile to attempt the segregation into the following categories: <sup>[102]</sup>

1. *Covert Scotticisms* – another name for them might be unself-conscious Scotticisms – are those expressions of partly or wholly Scottish provenance that Scottish speakers use without any very strong awareness of their distinctive Scottishness: they are for them unmarked – just the usual words for whatever it is. Examples are *forenoon*, *pinkie*, *rone*, and *split-new*.
2. Under *Covert Scottish Use* I have grouped items which are current in other uses in common core English but are also found in peculiarly Scottish covert applications, such as *cast out* ‘to fall out with someone’, *cast up* ‘to bring up as a reproach’, *the messages* ‘the shopping’, *to miss oneself* ‘to miss out’.
3. *Names for Inhabitants* is self-explanatory.
4. *Overt Scotticisms* are expressions which, at least when used by middle-class Scots, tote a Saint Andrews flag. They are used in the full consciousness that they are Scottish-marked expressions, so they are intended for stylistic effect, often as a way of claiming membership of the Scottish nation. You can hear the frequency of incidence of these expressions rise on certain social occasions. For example, on one occasion when I addressed the London Burns Club, I was delighted to hear the overt Scotticisms sounding all around me.
5. *Common Idioms and Sayings*. Nearly all these are overt, with similar functions to the Overt Scotticisms.
- 6.– 9. *Cultural Scotticisms* are names for features of the life or institutions of Scotland, legal and official terms, and so on. Of course they vary in abstruseness or, conversely, familiarity to non-specialists. I have aimed at what I take to be fairly widely current specimens.<sup>4</sup>
10. *Stereotypes or Vulgarisms* are working-class Scots exclamations, used only jocularly by middle-class Scots, but much favored by Scots comics; I might have

---

<sup>3</sup> [3] I am indebted to Miss Iseabail Macleod of the *Concise Scots Dictionary* for suggesting one of the groupings (viz. 2. *Covert Scottish Use*) and also a number of very useful single items in various of the groups.

Editor’s note: on covert Scotticisms, see further Aitken (1979; 1984b, 2015).

<sup>4</sup> Editor’s note: in the last forty years there has been a great deal of constitutional change, legislative innovation and discarding of tradition, which means that much of the institutional vocabulary has become merely historical (see ‘Scottish accents and dialects’, 1984a, 2015: n. 46, in the present edition).

increased the list of vulgarisms (Aitken, 1979: 108–110<sup>5</sup>), but the four I chose are perhaps the commonest.

11. Finally, on the grounds that a dictionary of English *might* wish as a bonus to include some of the more familiar literary vernacular expressions, I selected from a Burns glossary a list of 55 items which I judged to be either fairly common in Scots literature or from specially well known passages of Burns's poetry, like the word *agley*, as in "The best laid plans of mice and men Gang aft agley." These I have called *Burnsisms*.

One other type of item that I ought perhaps to have treated in the same way as the others is vernacular *Scots Variant Forms* such as <sup>[103]</sup> *auld* beside *old*, *cauld* beside *cold*, *fecht* beside *fight*, *flee* beside *fly*, *sair* beside *sore*, *tae* beside *toe*. To check this category out fully, one would need to assemble a long list of numerous different phonological types of variant. I did not do so, but perhaps may be allowed to extrapolate from the tiny list I have just given. All the dictionaries identify *auld* as a variant of *old*, in order to explain *auld lang syne*. Otherwise only CTCD, WNID3, and LDEL, in that order of copiousness, appear to list variants of this sort; neither CDEL nor the two American college dictionaries appear to.

In examining the entries for the 324 items tested in the five designated dictionaries, the questions I posed were:

1. Is the item in the designated Scottish use included?
2. Is the definition of the use in question adequate? I did not attempt to evaluate relative quality of definitions or to insist that the particular Scottish use was specifically mentioned, so long as it seemed to be covered. The definition of *General Assembly* in the Presbyterian context, for example, did not have actually to single out the Scottish Kirk.
3. Is the etymology acceptable? – which simply meant, is it not positively wrong, even if perhaps overcautious and unforthcoming? So, for example, "Of doubtful etymology" was usually accepted, even when I thought I knew of a more positive, albeit speculative, possible etymology.
4. Does the label cover the Scottish use, even if, as often in the Merriam-Webster series of dictionaries, it seems too wide or it hedges with "chiefly Scots" or "chiefly British"?
5. Is the pronunciation given as correctly as the dictionary's transcription system permits? For example, is the word *Covenanter* given with the correct Scottish stress-pattern or the Scots legal *caution* given its correct vowel? I also comment below on transcription systems as a whole.

Overall I was a very lenient examiner.

There follows a summary of the results of my examination for each of the eleven types of item examined and a tabulated summary of numbers of inclusions of each dictionary.

## 1. Covert Scotticisms: 24 items

*ashet*,  
*bangshoot* 'the whole bangshoot' (the whole caboodle),  
*blaeberry*,

---

<sup>5</sup> Editor's note: in the present edition see 'Scottish accents and dialects' (1984a, 2015).

*burn* (brook),  
*byke* (wasps' etc. nest),  
*byre*,  
*carfufffe*,  
*carry-out* n. (take-away),  
*coom* (sloping ceiling, <sup>[104]</sup> usually in an attic),  
*coup* n. (rubbish-tip),  
*fantoosh* adj. (fancy, flashy),  
*forenoon*,  
*handless* (awkward, manually incompetent),  
*harl* v. (roughcast'),  
*hinder-end* (final part, backside, etc. ),  
*jingbang* (bangshoot),  
*leet* (list of candidates),  
*och!*,  
*pinkie* (little finger),  
*rone* (horizontal roof gutter),  
*rowan*,  
*split-new* (brand-new),  
*swither* (hesitate),  
*Tam o'Shanter*

### **Inclusions**

CTCD	21
CDEL	13
COD	14
LDEL	11
WNID3	17

All include *ashet*, *blaeberry*, *byre*, *carfuffle*, *forenoon*, *och!*, *pinkie*, *rowan*, *Tam o'Shanter*;

all except LDEL include *leet*, *rone*, *swither*;

only CTCD has *coom*, *coup* n., *hinder-end*, *split-new*;

only CTCD and LDEL, have *carry-out* n.;

only CTCD and WNID3 have *jingbang*;

all omit *bangshoot*, *fantoosh*.

### **Definitions and etymologies**

WNID3 wrongly defines *rone* as 'a rainspout or pipe';

CDEL's etym. of *leet* is probably wrong

## Labelling

Several discrepancies in labelling, e.g.:

*forenoon* CTCD chiefly Sc and Ir, COD nautical, law, archaic, LDEL formal (actually, in everyday Scottish use);

*pinkie* CTCD, CDEL, and COD give as U.S. and Sc, LDEL as North Amer. and Sc, WNID3 without label;

*carry-out* n. CTCD Sc, LDEL NAm and Sc.

## 2. Covert Scottish Use: 32 items

*astragal* (glazing-bar in a window),  
*back of* [a time],  
*bramble* [the fruit],  
*cast out* (fall out with a person),  
*cast up* (bring up as a reproach),  
*close* n. (entry passage to a tenement 'stair'),  
*come* (as 'a week come Monday'),  
*corn* (oats),  
*doubt* + noun clause (be afraid that etc.),  
*factor* [of an estate],  
*grannie* (chimney-cowl),  
*hash* (work in a ramstam, flurried way),  
*jag* (prick),  
*keep* [in respect of health],  
*length* 'the length of' (as far as),  
*living* (infested (with)),  
*the messages* (the shopping),  
*miss oneself* (miss a treat),  
*next* (next but one): cf. *first* (next),  
*piece* (packed lunch, or sandwich between meals),  
*policies* (the grounds of a (usu. large) house),  
*resile* (back out),  
*row* (severe reprimand),  
*scheme* (housing estate),  
*shed* (part (the hair)),  
*shot* n. (turn),  
*sort* (mend),  
*stay* (reside permanently),  
*suit* as 'she suits the blouse',  
*tablet* [the sweetmeat],  
*tenement* (block of flats),  
*uplift* v. (collect (rent, a parcel) etc.)

### ***Inclusions***

CTCD	20
CDEL	10
COD	9
LDEL	4
WNID3	16

Only CTCD has *astragal*, *grannie*, *messages*, *shot*, *tablet*;

<sup>[105]</sup> CTCD and WNID3 have *cast up*, *cast out*, *close*, *jag*, *next*, *resile*, *shed*;  
none has *hash*, *length*, *living*, *miss oneself*, *suit*.

### ***Definitions***

Erroneous or inadequate definitions include:

CDEL *scheme* ‘a local authority housing plan’;

CDEL *tenement* ‘a large slum house etc.’;

COD *tenement* ‘dwelling house, esp. (Sc) containing several dwellings’;

CTCD’s definition of *grannie* as ‘a revolving cap on a chimney-pot’ is too narrow.

### ***Labelling***

CDEL, COD, and WND3 all label *doubt* archaic, and WNID3 *shed* as archaic; both however are current Scottish English;

*stay* is labelled Sc by CTCD, CDEL, and LDEL, unlabelled by WNID3;

*piece* is unlabelled by WNID3 but a Scots author is cited for it;

there are other labelling discrepancies.

### **3. Names for inhabitants of certain towns and districts: 10 items**

*Aberdonian*,  
*Bo’nessian*,  
*Brocher*,  
*Caithnessian*,  
*Dundonian*,  
*Galwegian*,  
*Glaswegian*,  
*Orcadian*,  
*Shetlander*,  
*Teerie*

***Inclusions:***

All include *Glaswegian* and *Orcadian*;  
all except LDEL include *Aberdonian*;  
CTCD, CDEL, and WNID3 include *Galwegian*;  
no other items, appear, so, e.g., *Dundonian* is nowhere recorded.

**4. Overt Scotticisms: 45 items**

*auld kirk* (whisky),  
*arizandum* (consideration),  
*bairn* (child),  
*ben* (into a house),  
*birl* (spin),  
*chuckiestane* (pebble),  
*clype* (tell tales, be an informer),  
*coup* v. (upset, overturn),  
*couthy* (congenial),  
*the craitur* (whisky),  
*darg* (job of work),  
*dinna* (don't),  
*dreich* (dreary etc. ),  
*droukit* (drenched),  
*dwam* (stupor),  
*feardie* (coward),  
*furth of* (beyond),  
*fushionless* (spiritless etc. ),  
*gey* (very),  
*girn* (whine etc. ),  
*greet* (weep),  
*haar* (cold sea-fog),  
*high-heid-yin* (person in authority, boss),  
*joukery-pokery* (trickery),  
*ken* (know),  
*kenspeckle* (conspicuous),  
*oose* (fluff),  
*outwith* (outside of),  
*oxter* (armpit),  
*peeliewallie* (sickly),  
*ploiter* (potter (about)),  
*puggled* (exhausted),  
*roup* n. (auction),  
*scunner* (disgust),  
*shoogly* (unsteady),  
*slàinte-mhath* (good health! ),  
*slaister* (mess),  
*stot* (bounce),  
*stour* (dust),



*stravaig* (wander aimlessly),  
*sweetie-wife* (gossipy person, usu. a man),  
*syboe* (spring onion),  
*wabbit* (exhausted),  
*wersh* (insipid),  
*Tammie Norie* (puffin)

### **Inclusions**

CTCD	36
CDEL	25
COD	12
LDEL	19
WNID3	36

All include *bairn*, *darg*, *gey*, *greet*, *haar*, *ken*, *kenspeckle*, *oxter*, *scunner*;

all except COD or LDEL or both include *avizandum*, *ben*, *clype*, *coup* v., *couthy*, *dreich*, *roup* n.,<sup>[106]</sup> *shoogly*, *slaister*, *stour*, *stravaig*, *wersh*;

only CTCD and WNID3 have *auld kirk*, *droukit*, *furth of*, *fashionless*, *syboe*, *Tammie Norie*;

only CTCD has the *craitur*, *dwam*, *peeliwallie*;

only WNID3 has *chuckiestane*, *dinna*;

only CDEL has *sweetie-wife*, and *slàinte-mhath* in full (CTCD and WNID3 have *slàinte*);

none has *feardie*, *high-heid yin*, *puggled*, *wabbit*.

### **Definitions**

CDEL has an inadequate account of *sweetie-wife* as “1. a garrulous woman. 2. (formerly) a woman who sells sweets”

### **Labelling**

Most items are labelled Scots, sometimes also with other localizations, esp. Northern English and sometimes U.S., Australia, or New Zealand or, sometimes by WNID3, chiefly Scots;

CDEL labels a few items (*darg*, *ken*) Northern British dialect, and four items in the latter part of the alphabet (*oxter*, *roup*, *slaister*, *stour*) Scots and Northern British dialect;

WNID3 thinks that *slàinte* is exclusively Irish.

### **Pronunciation**

CDEL’s only pronunciation for *stour* [stauə] is unheard of in Scotland.

## 5. Common Idioms and Sayings: 22 items

*it's back to the auld claes and parritch tomorrow*,  
*(he's a right) auld wife* (a fussy man),  
*to come up one's back* [of a task etc.] (to come to hand),  
*come into the body of the kirk* (don't hang back, come and join the party),  
*cauld kail het again* (lit. re-heated soup) said of a lecture, sermon, etc. used over again,  
*to go one's dinger* (to go at something boisterously),  
*a dripping* (or *dreeping*) *roast* (a continuous source of income),  
*to have a good conceit of oneself* (to think highly of oneself),  
*let that flee stick to the wa'* (to pass over a (more or less embarrassing) topic),  
*it's a sair fecht* (life etc. is a trial),  
*to the fore* (still alive),  
*to put another's gas at a peep* (to deflate another),  
*to set the heather on fire* (to cause a stir),  
*to give somebody the heave* (to dismiss him),  
*like a hen on a hot* (or *het*) *girdle* (extremely fidgety),  
*to be up to high doh* (greatly excited (about something)),  
*hide or (nor) hair of* ((not) a trace of),  
*to make a kirk and (or) a mill of* (to make what one will of),  
*(to keep) a calm sough* (to keep calm or quiet),  
*to be upstanding* [as a formal term at banquets or gatherings] (to stand up),  
*to work for sweeties* (for a pittance),  
*to wash its face* (to yield an adequate, if bare, profit)

### Inclusions

CTCD	6
CDEL	1
COD	0
LDEL	1
WNID3	3

(CTCD and WNID3) *to the fore* (unlabelled in WNID3) and <sup>[107]</sup> *calm sough* (labelled in WNID3, not in CTCD);

(CTCD and LDEL) *be upstanding*;

(LDEL and WNID3) *hide or hair* (unlabelled in WNID3);

(CTCD only) *dripping roast*, *set the heather on fire* (both unlabelled), and *wash its face* (labelled slang).

## 6. Cultural Scotticisms, Legal: 50 items

*advocate* (a barrister),  
*Faculty of Advocates*,  
*Lord Advocate*,  
*caution* /'keʃ(ə)n/ (security, bail),

(*Lord*) *Clerk Register* (formerly responsible for the state registers, now a titular office only),  
*College of Justice* (the members of the Court of Session collectively),  
*Court of Session* (the supreme civil court),  
*culpable homicide* corresponding to English *manslaughter*,  
*feu* (possession by a vassal of heritable property in return for payment of feu duty to a superior),<sup>6</sup>  
*habit and repute* ((the state of being) popularly held and regarded to be (e.g., married)),<sup>7</sup>  
*heritable* (pertaining to *heritage*),  
*heritage* (real property, as houses or lands, as opposed to *moveable* property),  
*High Court (of Justiciary)* (the supreme criminal court),  
*Inner House, Outer House* (divisions of the Court of Session),  
*indictment* (the form of process for bringing the accused to trial),  
*induciae*,<sup>8</sup>  
*jus relictæ, relictæ*,<sup>9</sup> (the relict's share of a deceased spouse's moveables),  
(*Lord*) *Justice-clerk* (vice-president of the High Court of Justiciary),  
(*Lord*) *Justice-general* (president of the High Court of Justiciary),  
*justiciar* (formerly, the or a supreme judge),  
*Justiciary* (the court of a justiciar, now the supreme criminal court),  
*Land Court* with jurisdiction in agricultural matters, including tenancies,  
*legitim* (that part of a deceased's moveable estate passing by law to his or her children),  
*moveable* (property (such as personal belongings) which is not *heritable*),  
*poind* /pɒnd/ (distrain upon etc.),<sup>10</sup>  
*Lord President (of the Court of Session)* (head of the Scottish judiciary, and also having the office of Lord Justice-general),  
*not proven* /'prɒvən/,  
*precognition* (the process of precognosing, or a witness's statement in the course of this),  
*precognosce* (carry out a prior investigation to discover if there is a case to answer),  
*procurator fiscal* (legal officer who initiates the prosecution of crimes),  
*Keeper of the Records* responsible for the preservation of the public records,  
*Keeper of the Registers* responsible for the registers of sasines and deeds,  
*reset (of theft)* (receiving of stolen goods),  
*retrocession* (return of a right temporarily assigned to another),  
*sasine* (the <sup>[108]</sup> procedure of giving possession of feudal property),  
*Senator of the College of Justice* (official title of a judge of the Court of Session),  
*sheriff* (judge of a sheriffdom),  
*sheriff depute* [this term long obsolete],  
*sheriff substitute* (an undersheriff),  
*Solicitor General* (deputy of the Lord Advocate),  
*tack* (lease),

---

<sup>6</sup> Editor's note: the feudal system of property tenure was abolished in 2000.

<sup>7</sup> Editor's note: abolished in 2006.

<sup>8</sup> Editor's note: "The period of time granted to a person between a citation to appear in a court of law and the date fixed for the hearing" (*The Scottish National Dictionary* s.v. *induciae*, quoting A. D. Gibb *Legal Terms*, 1946).

<sup>9</sup> Editor's note: "the share of a deceased spouse's moveable goods to which a surviving wife (*relictæ*), or husband (*relictæ*), is entitled, one-third if there are surviving children and one-half if there are none" (*The Scottish National Dictionary* s.v. *jus relictæ*).

<sup>10</sup> Editor's note: poinding was abolished in 2002.

*teind* (tithe),  
*Teind Clerk*,  
*Teind Court*,  
*Commissioner of Teinds*,  
*warrandice* (undertaking by a grantor or seller to indemnify the grantee or buyer in case of defect of title),  
*writer to the Signet* (member of a society of solicitors in Edinburgh, originally the clerks to the royal Signet, with the exclusive privilege of drawing up certain crown writs)

### **Inclusions**

CTCD	36
CDEL	14
COD	21
LDEL	9
WNID3	38

All include *advocate*, *Lord Advocate*, *feu*, *indictment*, *poind*, *procurator fiscal*, *sheriff*, *Solicitor General*, *writer to the Signet*;

CTCD and WNID3 and one or two others include *caution*, *Lord Clerk Register*, *Court of Session*, *High Court of Justiciary*, *moveable*, *Lord President*, *not proven*, *precognition*, *sasine*, *teind*;

only CTCD and WNID3 include *heritable* (in the Scottish use), *inducia*, *Lord Justice-clerk*, *Lord Justice-general*, *legitim*, *precognosce*, *sheriff depute*, *sheriff substitute*, *tack*, *warrandice*;

only CTCD includes *habit and repute*;

only WNID3 includes *heritage* (in the Scottish use), *Inner and Outer House*, *jus relictæ*, *retrocession*; none includes *culpable homicide*, *Keeper of the Records*, *Keeper of the Registers*, *Teind Clerk*, *Commissioner of Teinds*.

### **Definitions**

CDEL has inadequate or erroneous definitions of *advocate*, *Lord Advocate*, *feu*, *writer to the Signet* (identical to that of COD);

COD has a misleading definition of *moveable* and that of *writer to the Signet* is erroneous (this derives from earlier editions of COD);

CTCD's treatment of *habit and repute* is inaccurate.

### **Labelling**

CDEL and LDEL appear to think that only England had *justiciars* and *justiciaries*, and LDEL appears to think that only England has a *Solicitor General*;

WNID3 fails to label *caution* as Scots.

## **Pronunciations**

The distinctive Scottish legal pronunciation of *caution* is overlooked by COD and WNID3;

none of the accounts of the pronunciation of *poind* is quite satisfactory, the commonest pronunciation being given either not at all<sup>[109]</sup> or (by CTCD and COD) second;

only CTCD has the usual Scots pronunciation of *proven*.

## **7. Cultural Scotticisms, the Kirk: 15 items**

*beadle* (church officer),

*Cameronian* (member of the Reformed Presbyterian Church, originally a follower of Richard Cameron),

*commissioner* (to the General Assembly), including the *Lord High Commissioner* (the sovereign's representative),

*deliverance* (findings of a church court on a report),

*Disruption* (the split in the Established Church in 1843 when the breakaway Free Church was formed),

*the fathers and brethren* (collective term for the members of a church court, esp. the General Assembly),

*General Assembly*,

*Glasite* (a member of the sect founded in the eighteenth century by the Rev. John Glas),

*induction* of an ordained minister to a ministerial charge,

*kirk session* (the lowest of the church Courts),

*licence* to a candidate for the ministry to preach, corresponding to Eng. holy orders,

*precentor* appointed by the kirk session to lead the congregation in singing,

*probationer* (a student minister between his licensing and his ordination and induction),

*synod* (the church court above the presbytery)

## **Inclusions**

CTCD 12

CDEL 4

COD 7

LDEL 3

WNID3 6

All omit *the fathers and brethren* and *licence*;

only COD has *commissioner* (to the General Assembly), yet omits *General Assembly*, while itself using the term s.v. (*Lord High*) *Commissioner*;

only CTCD and CDEL approximate the Scottish ecclesiastical sense of *deliverance*;

LDEL and WNID3 overlook *kirk session*.

## 8. Cultural Scotticisms, Education: 15 items

*bursary* (scholarship to a student),  
*certificate of Sixth Year Studies*,<sup>11</sup>  
*dominie* (schoolmaster),  
*dux* (best pupil in a school),  
*Higher Leaving Certificate* replaced in 1962 by the Scottish Certificate of Education,<sup>12</sup>  
*Highers* colloquial for the preceding or for the Higher Grade examination of the  
Scottish Certificate of Education,  
*janitor* (caretaker of a school),  
*palmie* and *pandie* (a stroke with the tawse),  
*parchment* (a certificate to a qualified teacher on satisfactory completion of a two-year  
probation),  
*qualifying examination* (formerly, examination at the end of primary education to  
decide which type of secondary education the pupil should have),  
(*Lord*) *Rector* (in one of the older Scottish universities, the students' elected  
representative on the University Court),  
*Scottish* <sup>[110]</sup> *Certificate of Education* (the collective name for the examinations  
replacing the Higher Leaving Certificate since 1962),  
*Senatus (Academicus)* or *Senate* (the highest academic council in one of the older  
Scottish universities),  
*tawse* (leather punishment strap)

### Inclusions

CTCD	11
CDEL	5
COD	7
LDEL	5
WNID3	7

The definition of *rector* as head of a Scottish University by CDEL and LDEL, and by WNID3 as 'titular head', is inaccurate.

## 9. Cultural Scotticisms, General: 52 items

*Aberdeen Angus*,  
*Athole brose*,  
*Ayrshire cattle*,  
*Auld Reekie*,  
*bailie*,  
*Beltane*,  
*burgh*,  
*carse*,  
*ceilidh*,  
*chanter* (of a bagpipe),

<sup>11</sup> Editor's note: phased out from 2000 and replaced by the Advanced Higher.

<sup>12</sup> Editor's note: itself phased out from 1994 and replaced by the Scottish Qualifications Certificate.

*clarsach*,  
*clavie* (a tar-barrel torch burnt ceremonially in Burghead, Morayshire, on Hogmanay (Old Style), supposedly to ensure the town's prosperity),  
*cockie-leekie* (chicken and leek soup),  
*Common Riding* (an annual local festival in certain Border towns centred on the visiting of local boundaries etc. by a group of riders),  
*common stair* (communal staircase in a tenement),  
*convener* (the chairman of a committee),  
*Convention of Scottish Local Authorities*,  
*Corbett* (a Scottish mountain of between 2500 and 3000 feet, as listed by J. R. Corbett),  
*cornet* (the chief rider in a Common Riding),  
*Covenanter* /kʌvə'nantər/,  
*Culdee* (a member of a certain religious movement in the early Medieval Scottish (Celtic) church),  
*deacon* (the chief official of a craft or trade),  
*District* (since 1975, one of the subdivisions of a region, electing a council responsible for environmental health, housing, etc.),<sup>13</sup>  
*fiery cross*,  
*first foot*,  
*firth*,  
*Gaidhealtachd* (the Gaelic-speaking part of Scotland),  
*glen*,  
*Standard Habbie* (the Burns stanza of verse),  
*Hallowe'en*,  
*Highland dress*,  
*Highland dance*,  
*Highlander*,  
*Highland fling*,  
*Highland games*,  
*Highland gathering*,  
*Highland line*,  
*Highland pony*,  
*Highland regiment*,  
*(Royal) Highland Show*,  
*Highland Society*,  
*Hogmanay* /'hɒg-, also 'hʌg-/,  
*incorporation* (a craft association),  
*laird*,  
*och*,  
*Munro* (a Scottish peak of 3000 feet or more, as listed by Sir H. T. Munro),  
*provost* (before 1975, the civic head of a Scottish burgh, now only as a courtesy title in some local authorities),<sup>14</sup>  
*region* (one of the nine larger areal units for local government in Scotland, electing a council responsible for education, social work, transport, etc.),<sup>15</sup>

---

<sup>13</sup> Editor's note: the short-lived structure of nine regions (subdivided into districts) plus three island councils, was replaced in 1996 by 32 council areas (bearing some relationship to the pre-1975 counties), and for transport purposes, from 2006, by seven Regional Transport Partnerships.

<sup>14</sup> Editor's note: used by some of the post-1996 council areas as well as by some burgh community councils. From 1975, the title *Lord Provost* was reserved to Edinburgh, Glasgow, Dundee and Aberdeen.

<sup>15</sup> Editor's note: replaced in 1996 by council areas.

*shinty*,  
*strath*,  
*rone* (formerly, public weighing-machine in a market-place',  
*tulchan* (a calfskin, usually <sup>[111]</sup> that of her own dead calf, set beside a cow to induce her to give milk), hence *tulchan bishop* etc.

### **Inclusions**

CTCD	40
CDEL	27
COD	24
LDEL	24
WNID3	32

All include *bailie*, *Beltane*, *burgh*, *carse*, *ceilidh*, *chanter*, *Covenanter*, *deacon*, *fiery cross*, *first foot*, *firth*, *glen*, *Hallowe'en*, *Highlander*, *Hogmanay*, *laird*, *loch*, *provost*, *region*, *shinty*, *strath*;

three or four include *Aberdeen Angus*, *Ayrshire cattle*, *clarsach*, *convener*, *Highland dress*, *Highland fling*, *trone*, *tulchan*;

only CTCD or WNID3 or both include *Athole brose*, *Auld Reekie*, *clavie*, *cockie-leekie*, *Common Riding*, *common stair*, *Corbett*, *cornet*, *Culdee*, *incorporation*, *Munro*;

only CTCD has *Gaidhealtachd* (though WNID3 has the Irish *Gaeltacht*);

all omit *Convention of Scottish Local Authorities*, *Standard Habbie*, *Highland games*, *Highland gathering*, *Highland regiment*, *Highland Show*, *Highland Society*.

### **Pronunciation**

None has the common Scottish pronunciation of *Hogmanay* with /ʌ/;

COD and LDEL fail to note the Scottish pronunciation of *Covenanter*.

## **10. Stereotypes or Vulgarisms: 4 items**

*crivvens*,  
*help ma boab*,  
*here*,  
*jings*

### **Inclusions**

Only CTCD has *crivvens*, labelled dialectal;

none has the others.



## 11. *Burnsisms*: 55 items

*abeigh,*  
*abune,*  
*abreid,*  
*adle or aidle,*  
*aff-loof,*  
*ajee,*  
*agley,*  
*ahint,*  
*aiblins,*  
*airn,*  
*airt,*  
*auld-farrant,*  
*auld lang syne,*  
*aumous,*  
*ava',*  
*biggin,*  
*billie,*  
*birkie,*  
*birks,*  
*cantie,*  
*cantrip,*  
*carle,*  
*carlin,*  
*chap v. (knock),*  
*chief (intimate),*  
*chiel(d),*  
*clachan,*  
*cleek,*  
*cloot (hoof),*  
*cloot (cloth),*  
*Clootie,*  
*cockernony,*  
*collieshangie,*  
*coof or cuif,*  
*cowp v. (overturn),*  
*ding,*  
*kale,*  
*tacket,*  
*taet or tait (small amount),*  
*(the) tae or tane (one) ~ (the) tither (other),*  
*tappit-hen,*  
*tapsalteerie,*  
*tassie,*  
*tawie,*  
*tawpie,*  
*tent (heed),*  
*thairm,*  
*thrapple or thropple,*

*thrawn,*  
*threep,*  
*tocher,*  
*tousie,*  
*towmond,*  
*tulzie,*  
*Tysday* (Tuesday)

### ***Inclusions***

CTCD	48
CDEL	14
COD	9
LDEL	42
WNID3	52

### ***Labelling***

CDEL regards *cantie*, *tacket*, *tassie*, and *thrawn* as Northern British;

WNID3 prefers to label many items as ‘chiefly Scots’ rather than simply ‘Scots’.

### ***Pronunciation***

The systems of CTCD, CDEL, COD, and LDEL cannot cope with the final diphthong of *agley*;

WNID3 has an oddly narrow rendering of the vowel of *tousie* (and omits the diphthongal pronunciation).

## Summary of the Numbers of Inclusions

	Items set	CTCD	CDEL	COD	LDEL	WNID3
Covert	24	21	13	14	11	17
Covert Use	32	20	10	9	4	16
Inhabitants	10	4	4	3	2	4
Overt	45	36	25	12	19	16
Idioms	22	6	1	0	1	3
Legal	50	36	14	21	9	38
Kirk	15	12	4	7	3	6
Education	15	11	5	7	8	7
General cultural	52	40	27	24	24	32
Stereotypes	4	1	0	0	0	0
Burns	55	48	14	9	22	52
TOTALS	324	235	117	106	103	211

From the foregoing<sup>16</sup> it appears that the different functional types did not all realise the same coverage by the dictionaries. CTCD and WNID3 scored generally well except for *Common Idioms and Sayings*, which floored everyone, though CTCD and WNID3 again achieved a rather poor best. Perhaps this is because these expressions are relatively hard to find in the *Scottish National Dictionary* or so apparently numerous that it is difficult to know where to stop, so one might as well not begin. *Covert Scottish Use* gets a fairly poor response also, I am not sure why. The rejection of *Burnsisms* and of Scots variant forms like *cauld* and *sair*, however, is I take it the result of deliberate space-saving policy in the case of CDEL and

<sup>16</sup> Editor's note: for ease of comparison, the figures are given below as percentages:

	<i>n</i>	CTCD	CDEL	COD	LDEL	WNID3	average
		%	%	%	%	%	%
Covert	24	88	54	58	46	71	63
Covert Use	32	63	31	28	13	50	37
Inhabitants	10	40	40	30	20	40	34
Overt	45	80	56	27	42	36	48
Idioms	22	27	5	0	5	14	10
Legal	50	72	28	42	18	76	47
Kirk	15	80	27	47	20	40	43
Education	15	73	33	47	53	47	51
Gen.cult.	52	77	52	46	46	62	57
S'types	4	25	0	0	0	0	5
Burns	55	87	25	16	40	95	53
TOTALS	324	73	36	33	32	65	48

COD. Conversely, an oddity is the disproportionately high response for Burnsisms in LDEL,<sup>17</sup> following in this, as in other respects, *Webster's New Collegiate Dictionary*.

There is something approaching a consensus about the inclusion of about half of the items in the sections which get fairly good overall responses – covert and overt Scotticisms and general cultural Scotticisms – and between CTCD and WNID3 for the remaining included items, but I was not able to detect any regularity of agreement between the other three dictionaries in their other inclusions.

In the overall results CTCD wins hands down for its coverage of most types of Scotticism, as befits a work with a long history of constantly<sup>[113]</sup> accumulative compilation in Scotland, a rather indiscriminating selection policy, and a marked reluctance (for which it has compelling commercial reasons) to jettison any of its contents. If we except its surprising generous coverage of Burnsisms, the dictionary that seems to do least well, according to my sample, and so comes closest to the extinction of Scotland is LDEL, despite its claims to be “the most comprehensive ... authority on contemporary English throughout the world”.

From the sample examined it also appears that LDEL is the least sensitive that there is a partly different society north of the Border. Some of its gaffes are these: Its *corn* excluded the oats of Scotland. It extinguishes the Aberdonians altogether. It and CDEL find room for the English Lord Chief Justice, the Justice of Appeal, and the Lord President of the Council, but not the Scottish Justice-general, Justice-clerk, or Lord President, and, again like CDEL, it ignores most of the titles of the past and present officers of the Scottish sheriff-courts. The English school examinations, the Certificate of Secondary Education and the General Certificate of Education, are quite fully defined, the first described as a British examination, the second as a British national examination. But of the corresponding Scottish examinations, the Scottish Certificate of Education and the Certificate of Sixth Year Studies, there is no word. LDEL gets into the same fankle as several of the others with *rector*, and the Lord Rector of Scottish Universities gets no mention.

COD has the English High Court of Justice but not the Scottish High Court of Justiciary. It does have the Scottish Lord President but not the Justice-general or the Justice-clerk.

As a rule, if an entry gets in at all, its definition measures up to my not-too-stringent standards of adequacy. Some inadequacies have however been noted above. There are very few absolutely wrong etymologies.

In accordance with its well-known policy in that respect, WNID3 seems to me to display excessive caution or timidity in labelling. Sometimes it avoids labelling at all, as, for example, with *convener*, *forenoon*, *piece*, *pinkie*, though for *piece* in one of the Scottish senses it cites a Scottish author. It also hedges many of its labels with the modifier ‘chiefly’ such as ‘chiefly British’ (for *swither*), ‘chiefly Scots and Irish’ (for *oxter*), ‘chiefly Scots’ for *stravaig* and *trone* and a substantial number of its Burnsisms: so, according to it, *aiblins*, *auld farrant*, *aumous*, *billie*, *birk*, *cantrip*, *carlin*, *chield*, *cowp* v., *stour* adj., *tawpie*, *thairm*, *threep*, and *tocher* are all only ‘chiefly Scots’, though, for a change, *birkie*, *tapsalteerie*, and *townmond* are simply ‘Scots’. In<sup>[114]</sup> nearly all of this it is followed by its *New Collegiate*, which is in turn followed, almost exactly, by LDEL; one slight switch-around occurs with *cantrip*, which starts as ‘chiefly Scots’ in WNID3, switches to ‘chiefly British’ in the *New Collegiate*, and goes back to ‘chiefly Scots’ in LDEL.

There are also of course discrepancies and oddities in labelling in the other dictionaries. One is CTCD’s failure to label a number of items which I believe to be more or less exclusively Scots: *so grannie* (chimney cowl), *a dripping roast*, *pandie*, and *common stair* are unlabelled in CTCD; CTCD says *row* (reprimand) is archaic, but we use it all the time in my family and so do many other Scots.

---

<sup>17</sup> Editor’s note: i.e. as compared with CDEL and COD.

Two rather puzzling labels are *Webster's New World* label of *oxter* as 'Scots and British dialect' and CDEL's 'Scottish and northern British dialect' for several items in the latter part of the alphabet.

All the dictionaries fall down more or less on the pronunciations of certain words, CTCD least. They all get the Gaelic words *ceilidh* and *slàinte* right. CTCD, the only dictionary to include *Gaidhealtachd* /'gəiəltax/ or /'gəiəltax/, provides an acceptable pronunciation. But the legalisms *caution* /e/ and *poind* /ɪ/ are bungled, and only CTCD thinks to mention the Scottish pronunciation of *not proven* as *proven* /o/. None thinks to include the common Scots pronunciation of *hogmanay* with /ʌ/ as well as /ɔ/. Only CTCD and WNID3 mention the usual Scots pronunciation of *Covenanter*. For *auld lang syne* /səin/, CTCD, COD and CDEL<sup>18</sup> have only that pronunciation, or rather, have only /'ɔld 'lɑŋ 'sain/, for their systems cannot distinguish /səin/ and /sain/; CDEL, LDEL, and WNIN3 give /sain/ and /zain/, LDEL adding that the latter pronunciation is often used but is disapproved of by purists. The purists would include most Scots.

This leads us to the question of how far the dictionaries' transcription systems deal adequately with Scottish English pronunciation in general. The fact is that the systems of none of the British dictionaries are capable of representing certain essential phoneme distinctions of Scottish English, particularly the one we have just encountered. As a result, such words as /gəi/ and /ə'gləi/ have to be fudged or misrepresented, as /ge/ and /ə'gle/ or /gai/ and /ə'glai/.

The vowel distinction between /əi/ and /ai/ that I have just mentioned is universal in Scottish pronunciation everywhere. There is another unusual Scottish vowel – the one, /ɛ/, in *seven*, *devil*, *next*, *earth* (compare /ɛ/ in *leaven*, *revel*, *vexed*, *Perth*) – but not all Scottish speakers have this contrast, so its absence can perhaps be tolerated. All the systems have a means of representing the velar fricative /x/ in <sup>[115]</sup> *loch*, though CDEL gives offence to some by giving the variants with the non-fricative pronunciation /k/ first.

All the systems make certain sound distinctions that are unnecessary in some accents of Scottish English. For example, between the two vowels in *pool* and *pull*, where many Scots, such as myself, have only one vowel, but we can easily cope with that. More regrettable, perhaps, is the fact that two of the systems, those of CDEL and LDEL are non-rhotic, seemingly another indication of the South-East England bias of these dictionaries, thus excluding all those areas of England as well as Scotland with rhotic pronunciation of English. Though COD says its pronunciation model is Southern English Received Pronunciation, its system is in fact rhotic and can be used at sight by someone with a rhotic pronunciation. Though a rhotic transcription system is immediately adaptable to non-rhotic pronunciation by a simple deletion rule, the same is not true in reverse, unless the spelling is also invoked.

Both LDEL's and CDEL's transcriptions are quite specific to RP. CDEL even gives in IPA specific representations of RP vowels and diphthongs – the vowel /e/ as [eɪ], /o/ as [əʊ] and so on. Not only is this quite unsuitable for the rendering of Scottish pronunciation, which has quite different realisations, it also seems a bit of an insult to the vast majority of speakers of English who are not RP speakers. I think that general dictionaries of English aimed primarily at native speakers should go for broad systems of transcription with enough symbolic distinctions to accommodate the phonemic systems of several accents, but unspecific as to the precise local realisations of the individual diaphonemes represented, and of course rhotic. With one or two small modifications the CTCD or COD systems could be made suitable to represent Scots as well as Anglo-English pronunciation, but they are not there yet.

<sup>18</sup> Editor's note: CDEL added by AJA in a marginal note.

To sum up: Already CTCD is a very good dictionary for anyone seeking information on Scottish English, Scots, and Scotland, which is not to say that it does not also have some omissions and other defects to be made good. Much the same is true of WNID3; but many of its labels could safely be made more definite. The other three dictionaries I have examined can at least be acquitted of wholly extinguishing Scotland, but it is also clear that their coverage, and in various respects treatment of Scottish matters and Scottish English, leaves very much room for enlargement and enhancement.

I did not find time for more than a very cursory look at two other lots of dictionaries. The first of these was two American college dictionaries I happened to have to hand, *Webster's New Collegiate* (1973) and *Webster's New World* (1980). My impression of *Webster's New World*<sup>[116]</sup> was of a generally very low coverage of Scotticisms of any kind. *Webster's New Collegiate* was a little fuller, but its coverage seemed heavily skewed towards Burnsisms and fairly overt Scotticisms, and it seemed very poor on any kind of cultural Scotticisms, so it will be of little use as a guide to Scottish customs and society. Clearly it has been selectively derived from *Webster's Third*, which it follows with the same hedged labels. So it contains *agley*, *aiblins*, *cantrip* (with an interesting suggestion for etymology), *carlin*, *gey*, *girn*, *jag*, *handless*, *swither*, *tapsalteerie*, *towmond*, and *trone*, but, on a rather rapid scan, virtually no cultural Scotticisms except very obvious ones like *glen*, *laird* and *loch*. It also seems to turn out that many of LDEL's perhaps somewhat haphazard selections of Scotticisms, including the Burnsisms for which it has some penchant, come in turn by selection from *Webster's New Collegiate* – the text of the entries is usually virtually word-for-word identical. It does, however, remove some of the *New Collegiate's* Burnsisms, while leaving in others: for example, it takes out *tapsalteerie* but leaves in *collie-shangie*; it takes out *tocher* and *tousie* but leaves in *stour* adj. and *towmond*; maybe it became more choosy about Scotticisms toward the end of the alphabet. LDEL does, however, add some cultural and overt Scotticisms not in the *New Collegiate*. And in some instances it rewords a definition for the better or expands and improves a Scots entry, for *girn* and *tron*, for example.

The other set of dictionaries I ought to have considered was the OED and its *Supplement*. When I began this investigation I assumed that the OED could be ignored because its score for inclusiveness of modern Scotticisms and general reliability in other ways was bound to exceed that of any other dictionary except the *Scottish National*. This is probably true, though I do know of a number of oversights from OED and its *Supplement*, e.g. *carry-out*, *come up one's back*, *go one's dinger*, *dripping roast*, *fantoosh*, *Gaidhealtachd*, *grannie*. In a few instances the new *Supplement* improves on the Scottish period dictionaries by adding earlier and later quotations and in other ways, for example, for its entry for *deoch an dorus*.

So far I have been considering only dictionaries that are at the end of a long tradition, sometimes called derivation, sometimes called plagiarisation, from Cawdrey in 1604 down to the various modern strands of that tradition – the American College-Random House branch<sup>19</sup> leading to CDEL, the Merriam branch<sup>20</sup> leading to LDEL, the COD and CTCD in their own traditions, all going back to the Imperial-Century main branch,<sup>21</sup> with the COD and, especially, CTCD also drawing heavily on the OED.

There is another, largely separate, dictionary tradition in the<sup>[117]</sup> United Kingdom. This goes back a little beyond 1604 to 1597, to Sir John Skene's *De Verborum Significatione, the exposition of the termes and difficill words contened in the fovre buikes of the Regiam Majestatem, and vtheres in the Actes of Parliament and vsed in the practique of this realme*, i.e., Scotland. The line of derivation here runs from Skene and Thomas Ruddiman's splendid

<sup>19</sup> Editor's note: *The American College Dictionary* published by Random House.

<sup>20</sup> Editor's note: the Webster's dictionaries.

<sup>21</sup> Editor's note: *The Imperial Dictionary of the English Language* published in the United States by the Century Co.

Glossary to Gavin Douglas's *Æneid* of 1710, through John Jamieson's *Etymological Dictionary of the Scottish Language* of 1808 and 1825, to the *New English Dictionary*, which we now know as the OED, and the *English Dialect Dictionary*, then through the modern period dictionaries of Scots, the *Scottish National Dictionary* (SND) and the *Dictionary of the Older Scottish Tongue* (DOST) to the recently published *Concise Scots Dictionary* (CSD).<sup>22</sup>

The two traditions have been almost entirely separate, the principal shared resource being the OED, and, to a lesser extent, the SND and DOST, so far as these have been used by such dictionaries as we have been considering, by CTCD in fact quite a lot.

CSD is mainly a condensation of SND and DOST combined into a single sequence, but it also draws on OED for the latter part of the alphabet not yet reached by DOST. None of the dictionaries I have been considering, not even CTCD or WNID3, remotely approaches CSD's, inclusiveness of Scotticisms, its general fullness of treatment, the reliability and copiousness of its information on pronunciation, or has any of its datings and localizations. CSD is certainly a marvellous new resource for the study of Scottish vocabulary, a lot more convenient to use than SND, as well as more up-to-date in changes that have taken place in administration and education and other ways since SND was begun. So if the editors of general dictionaries of English thought to remedy the deficiencies of their coverage and treatment of Scottish English vocabulary, here is a splendid aid in doing so. But need they do so?

It is now possible to argue that the Scots are well enough served by way of a dictionary devoted entirely to Scots, so they can be expected to buy the dictionary of English of their choice for the common core vocabulary and that of other non-Scottish varieties, and in addition a dictionary of Scots (i.e., CSD) for the Scottish element. Until very recently this argument would not have applied, for the only really adequate and fairly up-to-date dictionary of modern Scots and Scottish English was the *Scottish National Dictionary* (in ten volumes, costing £450).<sup>23</sup> But at least we now have the *Concise Scots Dictionary* in one volume for £17.50,<sup>24</sup> taking in nearly every Scotticism, though it should be added that CSD is primarily a dictionary of *Scots* not of Scottish English, and expressions are often given their form in Scots, without <sup>[118]</sup> mention of the corresponding Scottish English form: so *cairry-out* is so given, not as *carry-out*.

But while I wish that my compatriots and others would buy the CSD as well as a general dictionary of English I doubt if all of them will. So I hardly think we can absolve the editors of dictionaries claiming fully to treat the vocabulary of international English from their obligation to deal adequately with the Scottish English element of that vocabulary.

But how adequate is adequate? I doubt if anyone at present could offer an objectively quantified estimate of the relative commonness or relative importance to users within or furth of Scotland of particular words and expressions or particular groups of these. Certainly I cannot. So if the editors of any of the dictionaries I have been examining or of any others did decide on a policy of enhancing the Scottish English content of their dictionaries by not excessively plagiaristic methods, I have no magic formula or rule of thumb for deciding on which entry or sub-entry should be added or enlarged and which should be omitted. It is possible that the categorization of types of Scotticisms I have used or something like it might serve as a guide to some of the choices which will need to be made, if for example the

---

<sup>22</sup> Editor's note: AJA wrote about the history of Scottish lexicography in 'The lexicography of Scots two hundred years since: Ruddiman and his successors' (1989). This is also the subject of Murison (1987). (AJA was a little bit out to find that he and Murison had been duplicating each other's efforts; the contributions to AJA's *Festschrift* were of course kept secret while in progress.) There is now a book-length treatment of the subject (dedicated to AJA) in Macleod and McClure eds. (2012).

<sup>23</sup> Editor's note: the ten-volume set is out of print; however a compact version in two volumes is available (as of 2014) at £175 (hardback), £120 (paperback).

<sup>24</sup> Editor's note: the 2014 price is £36.99 (hardback), £26.99 (paperback).

general policy was to select current general educated usage and current culturalisms but to leave out most Burnsisms. Whoever undertakes the large number of more or less arbitrary decisions about particular candidates for inclusion in the dictionary would need to be knowledgeable about Scotland and its English and also to commit a very considerable body of sustained effort to the task. At least there is now in hand a convenient and virtually complete list of all the candidates for inclusion in the shape of the *Concise Scots Dictionary*, backed up when necessary by its large parent dictionaries. The information about the historical and regional and occasionally stylistic provenance of each item that these works provide will often indicate the extent of the word's or the phrase's currency and interest, and so whether it need be considered for inclusion in a general dictionary of English. Of course if the CSD were to be drawn upon substantially in this way, it would be proper for the dictionary doing so to inform CSD's publishers and negotiate a proper financial return. Any dictionary attempting an enlargement of its Scottish English element will also need to take on board the fact that, among the international varieties of English, Scottish English must be one of the most copiously supplied with distinctive vocabulary, and so will demand a relatively liberal supply of space.

Another possible response to the need for a more adequate treatment of Scotland in the English dictionary would be to compile a <sup>[119]</sup> dictionary of English avowedly for Scotland, on principles comparable with those claimed for the *Dictionary of Canadian English* and, for Australia, the *Macquarie Dictionary*. I do not doubt that a new dictionary specifically directed at Scotland and with its decisions taken afresh could materially improve on the coverage and treatment of any of the dictionaries I have considered.

In principle I would not question the desirability of such a dictionary as a useful reference book for Scots and those with Scottish interest. For its compilation, one possibility seems to be some form of collaboration between the Scottish National Dictionary Association,<sup>25</sup> which owns the copyright in the *Scottish National Dictionary* and the *Concise Scots Dictionary*, and some commercial publisher which already owns an established dictionary of English. But in practice I have misgivings there are just not enough Scots and others who could be persuaded to buy such a dictionary in sufficient numbers to justify the large investment that would be needed to bring it about. Still, this seems to be a kite worth flying.

Scottish English is of course not alone in its marginal and problematic place in dictionaries of English. Some lexicographers of other national and regional varieties are also tackling the lexicographical needs of their own communities in their own ways. Beyond this, it occurred to me to wonder if we might not look one day for a composite dictionary of national and regional varieties of English which assembled in one volume material distinctive to particular English-speaking nations and major regions such as South-East Asia but left out the common core material. In that case of course we would again need to have two dictionaries – a common core dictionary and this proposed dictionary of regionalisms.

This composite work would be a genuine international dictionary of English and would of course need international collaboration. What a resource for connections and comparisons and just sheer information such a dictionary would be. It seemed to me worth making the suggestion and that this was the place to do it, but I am of course not competent to begin considering all the decisions such a project would require. Still, this is another kite that seemed worth flying – or another flea to leave sticking to the wa'.

---

<sup>25</sup> Editor's note: superseded by Scottish Language Dictionaries.



## References

- Aitken, A. J. (1979) 'Scottish speech: A historical view, with special reference to the Standard English of Scotland', in A. J. Aitken and Tom McArthur, eds., *Languages of Scotland* (Edinburgh: W. and R. Chambers), 85–118
- Aitken, A. J. (1984a, 2015) 'Scottish accents and dialects', in Trudgill, ed., 94–114. Reproduced in †Aitken ed. Macafee (2015), [online] [http://medio.scotslanguage.com/library/document/aitken/Scottish\\_accents\\_and\\_dialects\\_\(1984\)](http://medio.scotslanguage.com/library/document/aitken/Scottish_accents_and_dialects_(1984)) (accessed 27 April 2015).
- Aitken, A. J. (1984b, 2015) 'Scots and English in Scotland' in Trudgill, ed., 517–532. Reproduced in †Aitken ed. Macafee (2015), [online] [http://medio.scotslanguage.com/library/document/aitken/Scots\\_and\\_English\\_in\\_Scotland\\_\(1984\)](http://medio.scotslanguage.com/library/document/aitken/Scots_and_English_in_Scotland_(1984)) (accessed 27 April 2015).
- Aitken, A. J. (1989) 'The lexicography of Scots two hundred years since: Ruddiman and his successors' in J. L. Mackenzie and R. Todd, eds., *In Other Words: Transcultural Studies in Philology, Translation and Lexicology presented to Hans Heinrich Meier on the occasion of his Sixty-fifth Birthday* (Dordrecht: Foris), 235–245. [Online] <http://carolinemacafee.wix.com/ajaonscotlanguage> (accessed 29 April 2015).
- †Aitken, A. J., ed. Caroline Macafee (2015) 'Collected Writings on the Scots Language', [online] Scots Language Centre <http://www.scotslanguage.com/aitken-papers> (accessed 27 April 2015)
- The American College Dictionary* (1947) ed.-in-chief C. L. Barnhart (New York: Random House)
- Barrow, Geoffrey (1981) *The Extinction of Scotland* (Stirling: Scots Independent Ltd.)
- Cawdrey, Robert (1604, 1966) *A Table Alphabetical of Hard Usual English Words* (Gainsville: Scholars' Facsimiles & Reprints)
- Chambers Twentieth Century Dictionary* (CTCD) (1983) new edn, ed. E. M. Kirkpatrick *et al.* (Edinburgh: Chambers)
- Collins Dictionary of the English Language* (CDEL) (1979) ed. Patrick Hanks (London: Collins)
- The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Current English* (COD) (1982) 7th edn, eds. H. W. Fowler, F. G. Fowler *et al.* (Oxford: Clarendon Press)
- The Concise Scots Dictionary* (CSD) (1985) ed.-in-chief Mairi Robinson (Aberdeen University Press; now published Edinburgh University Press)
- A Dictionary of Canadian English* (1962) ed. Walter Spencer Avis (Toronto: Gage)
- A Dictionary of the Older Scottish Tongue* (DOST) (1937–2002) eds. William Craigie *et al.*, 12 vols. (Oxford University Press). [Online] 'Dictionary of the Scots Language' <http://www.dsl.ac.uk/> (accessed 7 February 2014).
- The English Dialect Dictionary* (1898–1905) ed. Joseph Wright, 6 vols. (London: Oxford University Press)
- Howse, Hugh (1985) 'Teaching English to the world', *English Today* 2 (April, 1985), 18
- The Imperial Dictionary of the English Language* (1847–1850) ed. Rev. John Ogilvie, 2 vols. (Glasgow: Blackie and Son; New York: The Century Co.)
- Jamieson, John (1808, 1825) *An Etymological Dictionary of the Scottish Language*, 2 vols. (Edinburgh: W. Creech), *Supplement*, 2 vols. (Edinburgh: W. & C. Tait)
- Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English* (1987) editorial director Della Summers (Harlow: Longman)
- Longman Dictionary of the English Language* (LDEL) (1984) (Harlow: Longman)
- Macleod, Iseabail and J. Derrick McClure, eds. (2012) *Scotland in Definition. A History of Scottish Dictionaries* (Edinburgh: John Donald)

- The Macquarie Dictionary* (1981) ed.-in-chief A. Delbridge (Brisbane: Jacaranda Press; now published Sydney: Macquarie Dictionary Publishers Pty Ltd)
- Murison, David (1987) 'Scottish lexicography' in Caroline Macafee and Iseabail Macleod, eds., *The Nuttis Schell. Essays on the Scots Language presented to A. J. Aitken* (Aberdeen University Press), 17–24
- The Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary of Current English* (1987) eds. A. S. Hornby *et al.* (Oxford University Press)
- The Oxford English Dictionary* (1<sup>st</sup> edn. 1884–1928) eds. James Murray *et al.*, 12 vols. (2<sup>nd</sup> edn. 1989) eds. John Simpson and Edmund Weiner, 20 vols. (Oxford University Press). [Online] <http://www.oed.com/> (accessed 7 February 2014).
- Ruddiman, Thomas, ed. (1710) *Virgil's Æneis, translated into Scottish Verse, by Gavin Douglas ... to which is added a large Glossary ...* (Edinburgh: Andrew Symson & Robert Freebairn)
- The Scottish National Dictionary* (SND) (1931–1975) eds. William Grant *et al.*, 10 vols. (Edinburgh: Scottish National Dictionary Association). [Online] 'Dictionary of the Scots Language' <http://www.dsl.ac.uk/> (accessed 7 February 2014).
- Skene, Sir John (1597) *De Verborum Significatione, the exposition of the termes and difficill words contened in the fovre buikes of the Regiam Majestatem, and vtheres in the Actes of Parliament and vsed in the practique of this realme* (Edinburgh: Robert Waldegrave)
- Trudgill, Peter, ed. (1984) *Language in the British Isles* (Cambridge University Press)
- Webster's New Collegiate Dictionary* (1973) eds. Noah Webster *et al.* (Springfield, Mass.: G. & C. Merriam Co.)
- Webster's New World Dictionary of the American Language* (1980) ed.-in-chief David B. Guralnik (New York: Simon and Schuster)
- Webster's Third New International Dictionary* (WNID3) (1961) eds. Noah Webster, Philip Babcock Gove *et al.* (Springfield, Mass.: G. & C. Merriam Co.)